v. C.A. # 05-120-JJF Indian River School District, et al. December 14, 2006

Page 1

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF DELAWARE

MONA DOBRICH and MARCO DOBRICH, Individually and as parents and next friend of ALEXANDER DOBRICH, SAMANTHA DOBRICH, JANE DOE and JOHN DOE, Individually and as parents and next friend of JORDAN DOE and JAMIE DOE, Plaintiffs, Civil Action v. No. 05-120INDIAN RIVER SCHOOL, DISTRICT, et al., Defendants.

Videotaped Deposition of PATRICIA S. OLIPHANT, Ph.D., taken pursuant to notice at 31 Hosier Street, Selbyville, Delaware, beginning at 11:00 a.m., on Thursday, December 14, 2006, before Terry Barbano Burke, RMR-CRR and Notary Public.
APPEARANCES:

BRIAN LENHARD, ESQUIRE
RICHARD S. HORVATH, JR., ESQUIRE
One Rodney Square
Wilmington, Delaware 19801
For the Plaintiff

WILCOX & FETZER

1330 King Street - Wilmington, Delaware 19801
(302) 655-0477

www.wilfet.com

v. C.A. # 05-120-JJF Indian River School District, et al. December 14, 2006

Page 2 Page 4 answering it because the court reporter can only take APPEARANCES (cont'd): 1 JARROD SHAU, ESQUIRE 2 down one conversation at a time. Drinker, Biddle & Reath, LLP 3 What is your full name? 3 One Logan Square Patricia S. Oliphant. 18th and Cherry Streets 5 And you're currently a member of the Indian Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103-6996 4 River School Board; correct? For the Defendants 5 ALSO PRESENT: 8 And you were elected a member of the school 6 9 board this year; correct? Lindsay duPhily, Videographer 10 A. Yes. 7 8 11 When did you decide to run for school board? 9 VIDEO SPECIALIST: This is the videotape 12 Approximately January of 2006. January or A. 10 deposition of Dr. Patricia S. Oliphant, taken by the 13 February. plaintiff in the matter of Dobrich, et al, plaintiffs, 11 14 Why did you decide to run? 0. 12 versus the Indian River School District, et al, Civil 15 Because I have a vast amount of experience in 13 Action No. 05-120. schools and I have a keen interest in education. I 14 The deposition is being held in the 16 15 offices of the Indian River School District located at 17 have four grandchildren and I'm interested in what 31 Hosier Street, Selbyville, Delaware. We are going 16 18 happens in schools. 17 on the record on December 14, 2006, at approximately 19 Q. Who did you discuss your decision with before 18 11 a.m. 20 deciding to run? The court reporter is Terry Burke from 19 20 the firm of Wilcox & Fetzer, Wilmington, Delaware. My 21 A. First my husband, then my two children. Then 21 name is Lindsay duPhily, and I'm the video specialist 22 some friends who sought -- well, who sought my -- maybe of Discovery Video Services, in association with Wilcox 22 23 they were first. Some friends who asked me to run. 23 & Fetzer. 24 Then my husband. Then my children. Then I discussed 24 Counsel will now introduce themselves and

Page 3

1

1 then the court reporter will swear in the witness. 2 MR. LENHARD: My name is Brian Lenhard 3 and I represent the plaintiffs, and with me today is 4 Richard Horvath. 5 MR. SHAU: My name is Jarrod Shau and I 6 represent the defendants in this matter. 7 PATRICIA S. OLIPHANT, Ph.D., 8 the deponent herein, having first been 9 duly sworn on oath, was examined and testified as follows: 10 BY MR. LENHARD: 11 12 Q. Good morning, Dr. Oliphant. My name is Brian Lenhard and I represent the plaintiffs in this 13 litigation. 14 15 Have you ever been deposed before? No. 16 Q. I would like to explain how it works. I'm 17 18 going to be asking you questions today and you're here 19 to answer them as completely and accurately as you can. 20 If you don't understand a question, please ask me to 21 rephrase it. 22 Even though this deposition is being

videotaped, please answer the questions verbally and

please wait until I finish asking the question before

Page 5 it with the president of my school board. I am the

2 executive director of Sussex Academy Arts and Sciences.

3 And I discussed it next with the

4 president of that school board. Then with the school

- President of that serious boards Then with the serious

5 board. Then with my staff.

Q. These friends who asked you to run, what did

7 you discuss with them?

8 MR. SHAU: Objection. Form.

9 You can answer.

10 BY MR. LENHARD:

11 Q. When he says you can answer, you can answer

12 the question if you understand it.

13 A. I can't answer specifically because I don't

14 remember specifically. I could only answer generally

15 about what I believe in, okay, and what I believe in

16 about schools. So to be specific, I can't be specific.

17 Q. Did you discuss prayer in schools with them?

18 A. Nominally. Nominally, if at all.

Q. Did you discuss this litigation with them?

20 A. Nominally, if at all, because I didn't know

21 enough about the litigation to discuss anything.

22 Q. When they asked you to run, did they bring up

23 this litigation?

24 A. Not specifically.

23

24

19

C.A. # 05-120-JJF

Indian River School District, et al. December 14, 2006

	Page 6		Page 8
1	Q. And did they bring up prayer in schools?	1	okay.
2	MR. SHAU: Objection. Form.	2	Q. Prior to running for the school board, did you
3	THE WITNESS: I honestly don't remember.	3	discuss with Jackie Wilson the practice of giving
4	BY MR. LENHARD:	4	prayer at the school board meetings?
5	Q. Did you discuss running for the school board	5	MR. SHAU: Objection. You can answer if
6	with any current or previous school board members?	6	you know what the practice of school board prayer at
7	A. I have to think about that.	7	the meetings means.
8	Yes.	8	THE WITNESS: I can't remember, to that
9	Q. Who would that be?	9	specificity, I cannot remember.
10	A. I'm going to tell you in a second. I'm having	10	BY MR. LENHARD:
11	a memory lapse.	11	Q. Did you discuss prayer in general in schools
12	Okay, yes, I discussed it with Gregg	12	with Miss Wilson?
13	Hastings and with Rick Cohee.		A. Probably.
14	Q. With either Mr. Hastings or Mr. Cohee, did you	14	 Q. Shifting the time focus to after you decided
15	.5 discuss this litigation?		to run, during your campaign, did you discuss your
16	A. Only that it was going on.	16	views on school board prayer with people?
17	Q. And with Mr. Hastings and with Mr. Cohee, did	17	A. No.
18	8 you discuss prayer in schools?		Q. And why is that?
19	A. I don't specifically remember.	19	A. Because on four different occasions I had
20	Q. Did you discuss running for the school board	20	questions posed to me by representatives of the media
21	1 with Lois Hobbs?		relative to the prayer issue (indicating), whatever
22	A. I don't remember. I don't think so, but I	22	that means, and I was very clear that I would not
23	23 don't remember.		respond to the questions because for the following
24	Q. Did you discuss running for the school board	24	reasons:

24	Q.	Did you discuss running for the school board		Todovior
		Page 7	1	Page 9
1	with S	Susan Bunting?	1	I had never read the litigation. First
2	A.	Prior to my running or after my running, after	2	off, what I knew about the issue was only what I had
3	I decided to run?		3	read in the newspapers, that's Point No. 1.
4	Q.	Prior to?	4	Point No. 2, I had never read the
5	A.	No.	5	litigation. I had never been privy to the counsel of
6	Q.	Did you discuss	6	the district's legal representatives.
7	A.	And I'll go back. I never discussed prior to	7	Three the district's legal
8	with Lois Hobbs, to my recollection.		8	representatives.
9	Q.	Prior to your running, did you discuss running	9	Three, I was not privy to anything that
10	for the school board with Jackie Wilson?		10	had gone on in executive session relative to the issue.
11	A.	Yes.	11	And No. 4, I was unaccustomed I do not
12	Q.	And did those conversations involve this	12	make statements I do not talk about things when I
13	litigation?		13	don't know what I'm talking about. I don't prejudge
14	A.	Yes. This litigation.	14	situations. I have to have the information before I
15		Can you clarify for me what "this	15	make a decision.
16	6 litigation" means? What does this litigation mean, the		16	Q. You mentioned there were four different times
17	whole enchilada what I read in the newspaper, what does		17	you were asked about these issues.
18	B this mean?		18	A. Uh-huh.
19	Q.	I'll ask a different question.	19	Q. Can you tell me what four entities?
20	A.	Okay, thank you.	20	A. There were three newspapers in the Indian
21	Q.	Did you discuss, prior to running for the	21	River Education Association. I don't remember what the
			ı	

3 (Pages 6 to 9)

22 newspapers are, but I responded in writing to each of

Q. Can you explain what the Indian River

23 the three newspapers.

Jackie Wilson?

23

24

22 school board, the school board prayer policy with

A. I don't remember discussing the prayer policy,

24

C.A. # 05-120-JJF

Indian River School District, et al. December 14, 2006

Page 10 Page 12

3

7

Education Association is?

- 2 A. Yes, they're the bargaining unit for the
- teachers, the custodians, and the secretaries. 3
- Q. And why did they ask you?
 - A. Because they were -- I was told that they were
- trying to get together a forum to present for the 6
- persons running for the school board to have a debate
- or to have a forum. And so they sent out -- that was 8
- 9 the first thing I heard. So they sent out these
- 10 questions.

5

- And then I think it was their intention 11
- to provide the press with those responses. So the 12
- 13 questions they asked me were questions they asked all
- 14 persons who were running for the school board. Or at
- 15 least that's what I believe.
- Q. And those questions also went to the standing 16
- 17 school board members who were running?
- A. I'm assuming so, but I don't know that for 18
- 19 fact.
- 20 Q. It's your understanding, then, that they were
- 21 trying to contact all candidates and not just you
- 22 specifically?
- 23 A. Uh-huh, yes.
- 24 MR. LENHARD: I'd like to mark as Exhibit

- 1 If you want to read it to me, then I'll respond if I
- 2 believe it's accurate or not.
 - Q. Okay.
- 4 When you responded to the newspapers,
- 5 you responded in writing to them?
- 6 A. Yes.
 - Q. Reading from the middle column toward the
- bottom of P 4239, the issue is, "On the board's refusal
- to settle prayer suit," and then it appears to be your 9
- response, "In this case I just don't know enough of the 10
- 11 particulars to offer an opinion," and that's the end of
- 12 it.

13

17

20

- Does that sound accurate to you?
- 14 A. Yes, it does.
- 15 Q. And that was an accurate statement when you
- 16 made it; correct?
 - A. That's correct.
- 18 Q. And it's still an accurate statement today;
- 19 correct? Excuse me. I'll rephrase the question.
 - At the time you made it, it was
- 21 accurate?
- 22 A. Yes, sir.
- 23 MR. LENHARD; all right, I'd like to mark 24
 - as Exhibit 73 an article from the Sussex Post dated May

Page 11

- 72 a document that's a copy of the Delaware Wave from
- 2 May 3rd, 2006.
- 3 (PX-72 was marked for identification.)
- 4 BY MR. LENHARD:
- 5 Q. Have you seen this article before?
- 6 A. I honestly don't know. Let me read it or let
- 7 me look at it.
- 8 I don't remember. I could have. Or
- I -- I don't remember. 9
- 10 Q. If you turn --
- 11 A. Okay, wait a minute. I'm just looking at this
- 12 page, okay, front page.
- Q. The front page of the article starts "School 13
- 14 Board Elections are on Tuesday."
- 15 A. Okay, yes, I have seen this one before, yes.
- Q. And the second page there's a caption and 16
- 17 there's a picture of you and there's responses that you
- 18
- 19 If you've read this before, are you
- 20 aware of any inaccuracies in those responses?
- A. First off, I don't have my glasses on so I 21
- 22 can't read the thing. Okay? I mean honestly. I can't
- 23 begin to even read it.
- 24 I don't know, because I can't read it.

1 4th, 2006.

2

4

7

9

17

19

(PX-73 was marked for identification.)

Page 13

3 **BY MR. LENHARD:**

- Q. Do you recall seeing this article before?
- 5 Probably, yes.
- 6 On this one on Page 1, which is P-2445, I'll
 - read for you that the questions asked of each school
- board candidate are as follows: 8
 - MR. SHAU: 2445?
- 10 BY MR. LENHARD:
- 11 Q. Yes. The top, the first part under, "Election
- 12 slated for Tuesday," on the one, two, fourth column
- 13 over there's going to be the start of a series of
- 14 numbers, and I was just going to read it for the
- 15 witness if she can't read it?
- 16
 - A. I can't read it, let me assure you.

"The questions asked of each school board

- 18 candidate are as follows:
 - "One, experience.
- 20 "Two, town of residence.
- 21 "Three, any children who go to school in
- 22 the district?
- 23 "Four, current position. 24
 - Five, community organizations.

4 (Pages 10 to 13)

C.A. # 05-120-JJF

Indian River School District, et al. December 14, 2006

Page 14 Page 16 to the press and relative in terms of high profile 1 "Six, why are you running for this 2 position? stirring of things. 3 But in terms of do I think it's an 3 "Seven, what issues do you feel are most 4 important issue relative to the operation of schools, 4 important to the school district at this time? 5 5 the answer to that question is no. "Eight, what is your opinion on the issue 6 of prayer at monthly board of education meetings? 6 Q. Would you agree that any school board member 7 should make sure that he or she is properly informed 7 "Nine, complete this sentence: 'I feel I 8 about this litigation? 8 can make a difference through my service on the board 9 9 of education because." A. Yes. 10 Did you respond to a survey like that? 10 And have you in fact taken steps since being 11 11 elected to make yourself properly informed? A. 12 A. I believe so. Do you believe it is this survey? 12 Q. 13 13 A. I think so. And what steps were those? And did you respond in writing to this survey? 14 A. Steps included listening to the school 14 0. 15 district's attorneys. Reading the complaint. 15 I'm pretty sure I did. 16 Q. In response to the question about school board 16 Can I ask him a question? Because I 17 don't know if it's something I can say. 17 prayer, on the next page, in the fourth column towards 18 Q. If it has to do with attorney-client the bottom, I'll read you your response or what the newspaper printed as your response. 19 privilege, you may ask Mr. Shau to clarify whether you 19 20 can answer the question as long as it has to do with 20 "I believe in prayer; I pray; I attend church. When I look at the mission and the goals of 21 attorney-client privilege. 21 22 If we need to take a five-minute break, 22 this district, I don't see the topic of prayer on the 23 we can take a five-minute break. 23 list. I don't think it is the mission of public 24 THE WITNESS: I need a one second. schools to build a religious base. I do think it is Page 15 Page 17 VIDEO SPECIALIST: You're off. Do you 1 the mission of public schools to build character and 1 2 demographic citizenship. Thus, is this an issue of 2 want to go off the record? 3 religion or an issue of democracy? Not having heard 3 MR. SHAU: I don't need to. MR. LENHARD: Let's just go off, take 4 4 the scope and depth of the original complaint, the litigation particulars, the attorneys advice and 5 your microphone down. 6 (A discussion was held off the record.) 6 potential outcome, I won't offer an opinion. I think 7 7 THE WITNESS: Okay. more deeply about issues, and I want to be more respectful of the district, the present board and the 8 So in terms of getting back to and in 9 complainants than to comment without having that 9 terms of getting myself more educated about this information." 10 10 situation, I've listened to conversation or -- yes, Do you think that's accurate? 11 conversation in executive session when the attorneys 11 12 12 have been present to advise of current happenings

A. I do.

13 Was that accurate when you made it? Q.

14 A.

15 Q. Do you think this litigation is important to

the Indian River School District? 16

17 A. I need you to clarify the question.

18 When you were running for school board and you

19 received a survey, a written survey from these

newspapers, and at least as far as the Post is

21 concerned, the only issue that it raised specifically

22 is school board prayer at the meetings, did that make

23 you think that it was important?

A. It made me think that it's important relative

13 relative to the case, and I think those are the

14 essential ways I have educated myself about the case.

15 BY MR. LENHARD:

16 Q. So after you educated yourself, what is your

17 response now to the Sussex Post question, "What is your

18 opinion on the issue of prayers at monthly board

19 meetings?"

20 A. Be more specific in your question. I mean

21 it's a broad question.

22 Q. If the school board prayer policy was up for

vote as to whether it should be adopted or not, would

24 you vote for it?

24

23

C.A. # 05-120-JJF

Indian River School District, et al. December 14, 2006

Page 18

1 Α. As it currently is?

2 Correct. Q.

3 Probably not. A.

- 4 Have you expressed your opinion to other
- 5 school board members?
- 6 Yes. A.
- 7 Q. Who did you tell that to?
- 8 The board and the superintendent.
- 9 Was this in executive session? Q.
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 What were their responses? O.
- 12 MR. SHAU: Objection. I'm going to
- instruct the witness not to answer. Conversations were 13
- 14 held in executive session with attorneys.
- 15 MR. LENHARD: The witness can answer as
- 16 long as it doesn't reflect attorney-client privileged
- 17 information.
- 18 MR. SHAU: It reflects work product as
- 19 well as attorney-client privilege as the discussions
- were held with the attorneys amongst other school board 20
- 21 members, and I'm going to instruct the witness not to
- 22 answer.
- 23 BY MR. LENHARD:
- Q. Why did you tell the school board members that 24

Page 20

- executive session with the attorneys, then I'll
- 2 instruct you not to answer. If it's been outside of
- 3 those sessions and in the context of your activity as a
- 4 school board member, then you can feel free to answer.
 - THE WITNESS: Then I won't answer the

6 question.

5

10

7 MR. LENHARD: The witness expressing her

8 own view is somehow attorney-client privilege?

9 MR. SHAU: Yes.

MR. LENHARD: How does that work?

11 MR. SHAU: It's attorney-client

12 privilege. If, for instance, we had discussions about,

13 say, settlement, those would be privy to

14 attorney-client privilege.

15 If we had discussions about strategy, 16 attorney-client privilege. If she's expressed those 17 things to us in those sessions, it's attorney-client privilege.

18

23

24

2

19 MR. LENHARD: Okay, we disagree, but if you're instructing her not to answer, we can always 20

21 come back.

22 BY MR. LENHARD:

> Q. Dr. Oliphant, I'm going to give you a copy of the school board prayer policy that has previously been

Page 19

- you would not have voted for the school board prayer
- 2 policy?
- 3 A. I didn't say that. You said that. I did not
- say -- that's not what you asked me. That's not what
- 5 you asked me.
- Q. I asked you would you vote for the school 6
- board prayer policy if it were to be adopted today? 7
- R A. And I said no.
- And I asked you did you discuss that with the
- 10 school board members?
- 11 A. Well, then, I didn't understand your question.
- Because I didn't understand your question because I did 12
- not understand the second question to mean discussion 13
- of adopting the policy, and I contend that was not your 14
- 15 question.
- 16 Q. Okay, my question is, have you ever expressed
- to other school board members that you would not have 17
- voted to adopt the policy as it stands? 18
- 19 A. No.
- 20 Q. Have you ever discussed with other school
- 21 board members any disagreements you have with any part
- 22 of the policy?
- 23 MR. SHAU: I'm going to caution the
- witness, if they were held in discussions with the

marked as PX-9. 1

Do you recognize this as the policy?

3 A. I think so. And when I say "I think so," I

got a policy manual, and I think it is. If it's

5 sitting in my policy manual and I open up to page

6 whatever page it is, then I know it is. Okay?

- 7 Q. Okay. When you say that you would not vote
- today to adopt this policy as the school board prayer 8
- 9 policy, what part of the policy do you have a problem
- 10 with?

11

A. I'm thinking.

12 I think in general I have a problem with 13 the policy because, as strange as it may seem to some people, it offers up the opportunity for anybody to 14 15 open a board meeting with anything they want to say as 16 a prayer.

17 If a board member chose to, he could or 18 she could begin the prayer with, begin this session

19 with a Mother Goose rhyme, okay. A person could pray

- 20 for the downfall of the United States. Okay? And I 21
- believe that it simply opens a door for things that 22 aren't necessary or a part of the proceedings of a
- 23 board meeting.
 - Okay. I'd like to ask you about one sentence

6 (Pages 18 to 21)

24

Page 21

C.A. # 05-120-JJF

3

5

8

Indian River School District, et al. December 14, 2006

Page 22

in particular in the top of Paragraph 4. If you can't

read it, I will read it. The first sentence in

- 3 Paragraph 4 says, "Such prayer is voluntary and it is
- among only the adult members of the board." 4
- 5 Do you see that?
- Uh-huh. 6 Α.
- 7 If the prayer is only among the adult members
- of the board, why do you think the teachers' 8
- 9 association wanted to get your views on prayer when you
- 10 were a candidate?
- 11 A. I have no idea. No one ever expressed an opinion to me. They just asked the question. 12
- 13 Q. Do you think that makes sense?
- 14 I'm not going to suppose what the teachers'
- 15 union had in mind. I won't do that. It's
- uncharacteristic of me. 16
- 17 Given your views on that about not giving
- 18 opinions without being informed, do you think it was
- 19 appropriate for the newspapers to ask candidates, even
- 20 candidates who were not on the school board who could
- not have read the information necessary like the 21
- complaint or talking to the attorneys, to offer an 22
- 23 opinion about prayer that they would publish in the
- 24 newspaper?

1

Page 24

- 1 MR. SHAU: Who did you ask those
- 2 questions to?
 - MR. LENHARD: We asked questions about
- 4 the newspaper to other candidates.
 - MR. SHAU: I can object now.
- 6 MR. LENHARD: And what does that do for
- 7 the other depositions?
 - MR. SHAU: We are here to depose
- 9 Dr. Oliphant. Those other questions -- and if you have
- 10 those dep transcripts here, I'll be happy to take a
- 11 look at them right now -- but pertain to individuals'
- 12 views as they were voting for or analyzing whether they
- 13 wanted school board prayer and their beliefs on it.
- 14 Dr. Oliphant can't say why she would
- 15 think that them asking those questions is important.
- 16 You can ask her questions. I'll instruct
- 17 the witness whether or not I think she should answer.
- 18 BY MR. LENHARD:
- 19 Dr. Oliphant, is it your understanding that
- 20 voters viewed prayer as important in the campaign?
- 21 MR. SHAU: Objection. You can answer if
- 22 you know what the voters' views were.
- THE WITNESS: I don't know. Some voters 23
- 24 must have, some voters didn't.

Page 23

- MR. SHAU: I'm going to object. This has
- 2 no relevance to the school board prayer
- 3 constitutionality. I just don't see the relevance of
- 4 this questioning in this phase of the discovery.
- 5 MR. LENHARD: I thought the purpose was 6 primarily to come talk here about Miss Oliphant and her
- 7 role in the campaign.
- 8 MR. SHAU: As it pertains to school board 9 prayer.
- 10 MR. LENHARD: And that question's not
- 11 directed to school board prayer?
- 12
- MR. SHAU: Whether or not she thinks it's 13 appropriate for a newspaper to ask her a question
- 14 anyway, feel free to depose the newspaper. They could
- 15 have asked her what color socks do you wear. It's not
- relevant to this phase of the discovery. 16
- 17 MR. LENHARD: Are you instructing her not
- 18 to answer?
- 19 MR. SHAU: I am.
- 20 MR. LENHARD: Are you aware that we have
- 21 asked these questions of other people, Jarrod?
- 22 MR. SHAU: I am.
- 23 MR. LENHARD: And you didn't object
- 24 before?

- BY MR. LENHARD: 1
- 2 Q. Did you talk to any voters during your
- 3 campaign?
- Yes.
- What did you talk about?
- 6 Talked about my views on schools.
- 7 Q. Did anyone ever raise the issue of prayer in
- 8 schools to you?
- 9 Maybe once or twice.
- 10 Q. And do you recall specifically what those
- 11
- 12 No. But my response, whatever the question
- 13 was, my response was the same response I gave the
- 14 newspaper, I wasn't going to comment about something I
- 15 didn't have information on.
- 16 Q. So before you got elected to the school board,
- 17 you never gave an opinion to anybody about school board
- 18
- 19 A. I don't know. I don't remember if I ever gave
- 20 an opinion about school board prayer.
- 21 Q. As you sit here --
- 22 A. Because it's still school board prayer. What
- 23 does that mean? School board prayer. The Indian
- 24 River -- what the Indian River School District does,

Page 25

v. C.A. # 05-120-JJF Indian River School District, et al. December 14, 2006

Page 28

Page 26

- 1 what an individual board member does. I'm not sure of
- 2 the question and I'm not trying to be hard to get along
- 3 with. I'm saying you got this broad question out there
- 4 that is no simple easy answer to.
 - Q. During your campaign, did you ever express an
- 6 opinion about school board members offering a prayer at
- 7 an Indian River School meeting?
- 8 A. I'm not sure.

5

- Q. But you don't remember specifically ever
- 10 discussing it with anyone as we sit here now?
- 11 A. Not any specifics, that is correct.
- 12 O. You don't think a candidate who is against
- 13 school board prayer could have been elected, do you?
- 14 A. Excuse me?
- 15 Q. Do you think that a candidate who was against
- 16 school board prayer could have been elected?
- 17 A. Yes
- 18 Q. Were any of the candidates who were elected
- 19 against school board prayer?
- 20 A. I don't know.
- 21 Q. You didn't read the other candidates'
- 22 positions?
- 23 A. No. Not -- I mean no. Or if I did, it didn't
- 24 make a whole lot of difference to me. I was interested

- 1 did; maybe she didn't.
- 2 Q. How would you describe her position?
- 3 A. Based on kind of more generalized what I
- 4 recall, and it's very general, I don't think Jackie
- 5 Wilson is against prayer. Okay? I know that Jackie
- 6 Wilson has two grandchildren and I know they are
- 7 Jewish, and so I think any kind of conversation we
- 8 would have had would have been more revolved around not
- 9 being against prayer, but being inclusive in prayer.
- 10 Q. And Miss Wilson lost the election; correct?
- 11 A. That's correct.
- 12 Q. And she lost it to Charles Bireley; correct?
- 13 A. That's correct.
- 14 Q. And Mr. Bireley's a school board member?
- 15 A. That's correct.
- 16 Q. And Mr. Bireley campaigned for continuing the
- 17 practice of school board prayer with Christian prayers?
- 18 A. Yeah, probably. Did I read -- I guess so. I
- 19 mean, again, I wasn't tuned in to what Mr. Bireley was
- 20 doing.
- 21 Q. Are you aware of any instances during the
- 22 campaign when Mr. Bireley described Miss Wilson's
- 23 position on school board prayer as being against school
- 24 board prayer?

Page 27

1

- 1 in what my position -- I was interested in what I'm
- 2 going to do. Not where other people are. Because I
- 3 had to get elected first. So where other people were
- 4 wasn't going to influence me particularly until I
- 5 figured out where I was myself.
- 6 Q. You weren't concerned that your views might be
- 7 opposite the other people who were elected?
- 8 A. No.
- 9 Q. Do you think that a candidate who is
- 10 non-Christian could have been elected?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 O. Were all the successful candidates Christian?
- 13 A. I don't know.
- 14 Q. You know Jackie Wilson; correct?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. And she was a candidate for the school board
- 17 in this year's election; correct?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. And Miss Wilson's position on school board
- 20 prayer was she was in favor of non-sectarian prayer;
- 21 correct?
- 22 A. That sounds close. I don't know that I ever
- 23 heard her say I'm in favor of non-sectarian prayer. I
- 24 don't know that I ever heard her say that. Maybe she

- Page 29

 A. I don't know. I don't remember. I think I
- 2 would have the general idea that prayer -- I can say
- 3 this: I think that prayer was an issue in that
- 4 campaign. I think it became -- well, I personally
- 5 believe it became an unnecessary issue, because schools
- 6 are about a whole lot more than prayer. Schools --
- 7 well, never mind.
- 8 Q. Have you expressed that view to Mr. Bireley?
 - I can't respond to that question.
- 10 Q. Do you have --
 - I can't respond to that question.
- Q. Unless your attorney instructs you not to
- 13 respond.

11

- 14 MR. SHAU: If the answer is it was at
- 15 executive session, I'm going to instruct the witness
- 16 not to answer.
- 17 THE WITNESS: I can't answer the
- 18 question.
- 19 BY MR. LENHARD:
- 20 Q. Did any voter ever tell you that he or she
- 21 wants the school board to pray at its meetings?
- 22 A. Not specifically.
- 23 Q. When you say "not specifically," what does
- 24 that mean?

8 (Pages 26 to 29)

1

C.A. # 05-120-JJF

Indian River School District, et al. December 14, 2006

Page 32

Page 30

I'll clarify it. Do you have a general

- understanding that was the point of the person's 2
- 3 conversation, it's just not the same words that I used?
- 4 A. No. I believe, I truly believe that there are
- persons out there who do not believe it is appropriate
- 6 for the school board to pray at school board meetings.
- 7
- I believe there are persons out there who believe it is 8 very appropriate for the board to pray at school board
- 9 meetings. I believe there are people out there who
- 10 believe it's very appropriate and it should be
- non-sectarian. And I believe there are people out 11
- 12 there that believe that this is an issue of
- 13 constitutionality and whoever is sitting and praying
- should have the right to say what is in his heart. 14
- That's what I believe. And I believe that there is no 15
- single answer to this question. 16
- Do you believe that these issues came up 17
- 18 during your campaign?
- 19 **During?**
- 20 Your campaign?
- 21 A. The prayer issue did not surface in my
- 22 campaign.
- 23 Did the prayer issue surface in the election Q.
- in general?

- it with you?
- 2 Ask me the question again.
- 3 I didn't understand what your "in general" --
- 4 Well, I think you're generalizing -- those
- questions are very general questions, they are general
- 6 questions and I think it's more complex than -- I don't
- 7 think there's just a yes and no answer to all of this
- stuff, and I know that my role is to just respond to
- what you're asking me with a yes or no.
- 10 Q. Did you discuss the results of the election
- 11 with people in this district?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. And did those discussions relate to school
- 14 board prayer?
- 15 Some did and some didn't.
- 16 O. The ones that did, what did you discuss with
- 17 those people?
- 18 A. That the school, for the few people that I may
- have discussed it with, that the school prayer issue 19
- 20 did not seem to be a source of contention for people
- 21 where I lived, but I did believe that it was a source
- 22 of contention and furor and stirring in the area where
- 23 Jackie Wilson lived.
- 24 Q. There's been testimony from Mrs. Bunting, Nina

Page 31

- 1 A. Yes, in my opinion.
- 2 Did any voters in the district ever tell you
- that they view the board's prayer policy as protecting
- 4 Christian prayer?
- 5 No, I don't think so.
- 6 Did any voters ever tell you that they viewed
- 7 the school board's prayer policy as promoting
- 8 Christianity?
- 9 No, I don't think so.
- 10 Have you ever discussed with anyone whether
- 11 the results of the 2006 election were an endorsement of
- 12 the stance the school board has taken in support of
- school board prayer? 13
- 14 A. What was the first part of the question?
- Have you ever discussed with anyone whether 15
- the results of the 2006 election were an endorsement of 16
- 17 the stance the school board has taken in support of
- 18 school board prayer?
- 19 A. The election in general?
- 20 The results of the election? Q.
- 21 A. In general?
- 22 Q. Yes.
- 23 A. The answer is no, in general.
- 24 Well, more specifically, has someone discussed

- Page 33 Lou Bunting, that you would feel uncomfortable offering
- prayer at a school board meeting. Is that true?
- 3 A. I have made the statement to the board -- no,
- to the board president, to the board president. Nina
- Lou is not the board president. But I told the board
- president, because he offers the opportunity for
- 7 everybody to pray. And I made the statement that when
- I offer prayer it's going to be for a moment of silence
- because I do not wish to pray publicly. That I think a
- 10 moment of silence is fitting at a school board
- 11 assemblage.
- 12 When you say school board president, you mean
- 13 Mr. Bireley?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 What was Mr. Bireley's reaction to your Q.
- 16 statement?
- 17 A. He was fine with it. Absolutely fine with it.
- 18 Q. Did he say he'll put you in the rotation?
- 19 He did put me in the rotation.
- Have you offered a moment of silence? 20 Q.
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 When was that?
- 23 I think it was -- what month are we in? -- I
- 24 think it was in November's meeting.

9 (Pages 30 to 33)

Indian River School District, et al. C.A. # 05-120-JJF Patricia S. Oliphant, Ph.D. December 14, 2006 Page 34 Page 36 Q. Do you --1 1 2 INDEX 2 A. One of the nights you guys weren't 3 DEPONENT: Patricia S. Oliphant **PAGE** 3 videotaping. 4 Examination by Mr. Lenhard 3 Q. Do you believe that Mr. Bireley's rotation 5 EXHIBITS process conforms to the school board prayer policy in 5 PLAINTIFF'S DEPOSITION EXHIBITS 6 MARKED 6 front of you? 7 P-72 Delaware Wave Article, P-2438 11 7 A. Yes. 8 P-73 Sussex Post article, P-2445-P2448 13 8 Did this discussion with Mr. Bireley happen as 9 part of your orientation, to use a better word, as 9 ERRATA SHEET/DEPONENT'S SIGNATURE PAGE 37 becoming a new school board member? 10 10 11 A. Fairly close. I mean our first orientation PAGE 38 CERTIFICATE OF REPORTER 12 was with the superintendent, okay, so that was our 11 orientation. But Mr. Bireley asked me fairly early 12 13 14 in -- I have been on the board since July. 14 15 He asked me fairly early -- he just said 15 to me, he said, Trish, I ask each board member if they 16 16 17 want to offer prayer. If you want to, great; if you 17 don't, I'll move on, but I'll call you, I'll give you a 18 18 19 heads up. And he did. 19 Q. So in November, shortly before, a few days 20 20 before the meeting, you're saying Mr. Bireley called 21 21 22 you and asked you --22 23 A. Uh-huh. 23 24 -- and asked you if you wanted to offer a 24 Page 35 Page 37 moment of silence? 1 2 2 A. No. He called me and asked me if I wanted to 3 3 offer the prayer. And I said, Yeah, I'll be glad to, REPLACE THIS PAGE but I want you to know it's going to be a moment of 4 5 silence, it's not going to be an open prayer. And I WITH THE ERRATA SHEET 6 said fine. 5 AFTER IT HAS BEEN 7 MR. LENHARD: I want to take a 6 8 five-minute break. COMPLETED AND SIGNED 9 VIDEO SPECIALIST: Going off the record 7 at approximately 11:49 a.m. 10 BY THE DEPONENT 8 11 (Recess.) 9 VIDEO SPECIALIST: We're back on the 12 10 13 record at approximately 11:57 a.m. 11 14 MR. LENHARD: Dr. Oliphant, I have no 12 further questions. Thank you very much for your time. 15 13 14 16 THE WITNESS: Okay. 15 17 VIDEO SPECIALIST: The deposition is 16 18 ending at approximately 11:57 a.m. 17 19 (Witness excused.) 18 20 (The deposition concluded at 11:57 a.m.) 19 20 21 21 22 22 23 23 24 24

Dobrich

v. C.A. # 05-120-JJF Indian River School District, et al. December 14, 2006

```
Page 38
 1 State of Delaware )
    New Castle County )
                CERTIFICATE OF REPORTER
          I, Terry B. Burke, RMR-CRR and Notary Public,
    do hereby certify that there came before me on
    Thursday, December 14, 2006, the deponent herein,
    Patricia S. Oliphant, Ph.D., who was duly swom by me
    and thereafter examined by counsel for the respective
    parties; that the questions asked of said deponent and
    the answers given were taken down by me in Stenotype
    notes and thereafter transcribed by use of
    computer-aided transcription and computer printer under
    my direction.
10
          I further certify that the foregoing is a true
    and correct transcript of the testimony given at said
11
    examination of said witness.
          I further certify that I am not counsel,
12
    attorney, or relative of either party, or otherwise
13
    interested in the event of this suit.
14
15
16
             Terry Barbano Burke, RMR-CRR
17
                Certification No. 233-RPR
18
                (Expires January 31, 2008)
19
20
21
    DATED:
22
23
24
```